

1 David B. Rosenbaum, 009819  
2 Thomas L. Hudson, 014485  
3 Sara S. Greene, 022706  
4 OSBORN MALEDON, P.A.  
5 2929 North Central Avenue, 21st Floor  
6 Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2793  
7 (602) 640-9000  
8 E-mail: thudson@omlaw.com  
9 E-mail: drosenbaum@omlaw.com  
10 E-mail: sgreene@omlaw.com

11 David J. Bodney, 06065  
12 Karen J. Hartman-Tellez, 021121  
13 STEPTOE & JOHNSON LLP  
14 Collier Center  
15 201 East Washington Street  
16 Suite 1600  
17 Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2382  
18 E-mail: dbodney@steptoe.com  
19 E-mail: khartman@steptoe.com

20 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91  
92  
93  
94  
95  
96  
97  
98  
99  
100  
101  
102  
103  
104  
105  
106  
107  
108  
109  
110  
111  
112  
113  
114  
115  
116  
117  
118  
119  
120  
121  
122  
123  
124  
125  
126  
127  
128  
129  
130  
131  
132  
133  
134  
135  
136  
137  
138  
139  
140  
141  
142  
143  
144  
145  
146  
147  
148  
149  
150  
151  
152  
153  
154  
155  
156  
157  
158  
159  
160  
161  
162  
163  
164  
165  
166  
167  
168  
169  
170  
171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176  
177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182  
183  
184  
185  
186  
187  
188  
189  
190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196  
197  
198  
199  
200  
201  
202  
203  
204  
205  
206  
207  
208  
209  
210  
211  
212  
213  
214  
215  
216  
217  
218  
219  
220  
221  
222  
223  
224  
225  
226  
227  
228  
229  
230  
231  
232  
233  
234  
235  
236  
237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243  
244  
245  
246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259  
260  
261  
262  
263  
264  
265  
266  
267  
268  
269  
270  
271  
272  
273  
274  
275  
276  
277  
278  
279  
280  
281  
282  
283  
284  
285  
286  
287  
288  
289  
290  
291  
292  
293  
294  
295  
296  
297  
298  
299  
300  
301  
302  
303  
304  
305  
306  
307  
308  
309  
310  
311  
312  
313  
314  
315  
316  
317  
318  
319  
320  
321  
322  
323  
324  
325  
326  
327  
328  
329  
330  
331  
332  
333  
334  
335  
336  
337  
338  
339  
340  
341  
342  
343  
344  
345  
346  
347  
348  
349  
350  
351  
352  
353  
354  
355  
356  
357  
358  
359  
360  
361  
362  
363  
364  
365  
366  
367  
368  
369  
370  
371  
372  
373  
374  
375  
376  
377  
378  
379  
380  
381  
382  
383  
384  
385  
386  
387  
388  
389  
390  
391  
392  
393  
394  
395  
396  
397  
398  
399  
400  
401  
402  
403  
404  
405  
406  
407  
408  
409  
410  
411  
412  
413  
414  
415  
416  
417  
418  
419  
420  
421  
422  
423  
424  
425  
426  
427  
428  
429  
430  
431  
432  
433  
434  
435  
436  
437  
438  
439  
440  
441  
442  
443  
444  
445  
446  
447  
448  
449  
450  
451  
452  
453  
454  
455  
456  
457  
458  
459  
460  
461  
462  
463  
464  
465  
466  
467  
468  
469  
470  
471  
472  
473  
474  
475  
476  
477  
478  
479  
480  
481  
482  
483  
484  
485  
486  
487  
488  
489  
490  
491  
492  
493  
494  
495  
496  
497  
498  
499  
500  
501  
502  
503  
504  
505  
506  
507  
508  
509  
510  
511  
512  
513  
514  
515  
516  
517  
518  
519  
520  
521  
522  
523  
524  
525  
526  
527  
528  
529  
530  
531  
532  
533  
534  
535  
536  
537  
538  
539  
540  
541  
542  
543  
544  
545  
546  
547  
548  
549  
550  
551  
552  
553  
554  
555  
556  
557  
558  
559  
560  
561  
562  
563  
564  
565  
566  
567  
568  
569  
570  
571  
572  
573  
574  
575  
576  
577  
578  
579  
580  
581  
582  
583  
584  
585  
586  
587  
588  
589  
590  
591  
592  
593  
594  
595  
596  
597  
598  
599  
600  
601  
602  
603  
604  
605  
606  
607  
608  
609  
610  
611  
612  
613  
614  
615  
616  
617  
618  
619  
620  
621  
622  
623  
624  
625  
626  
627  
628  
629  
630  
631  
632  
633  
634  
635  
636  
637  
638  
639  
640  
641  
642  
643  
644  
645  
646  
647  
648  
649  
650  
651  
652  
653  
654  
655  
656  
657  
658  
659  
660  
661  
662  
663  
664  
665  
666  
667  
668  
669  
670  
671  
672  
673  
674  
675  
676  
677  
678  
679  
680  
681  
682  
683  
684  
685  
686  
687  
688  
689  
690  
691  
692  
693  
694  
695  
696  
697  
698  
699  
700  
701  
702  
703  
704  
705  
706  
707  
708  
709  
710  
711  
712  
713  
714  
715  
716  
717  
718  
719  
720  
721  
722  
723  
724  
725  
726  
727  
728  
729  
730  
731  
732  
733  
734  
735  
736  
737  
738  
739  
740  
741  
742  
743  
744  
745  
746  
747  
748  
749  
750  
751  
752  
753  
754  
755  
756  
757  
758  
759  
760  
761  
762  
763  
764  
765  
766  
767  
768  
769  
770  
771  
772  
773  
774  
775  
776  
777  
778  
779  
780  
781  
782  
783  
784  
785  
786  
787  
788  
789  
790  
791  
792  
793  
794  
795  
796  
797  
798  
799  
800  
801  
802  
803  
804  
805  
806  
807  
808  
809  
810  
811  
812  
813  
814  
815  
816  
817  
818  
819  
820  
821  
822  
823  
824  
825  
826  
827  
828  
829  
830  
831  
832  
833  
834  
835  
836  
837  
838  
839  
840  
841  
842  
843  
844  
845  
846  
847  
848  
849  
850  
851  
852  
853  
854  
855  
856  
857  
858  
859  
860  
861  
862  
863  
864  
865  
866  
867  
868  
869  
870  
871  
872  
873  
874  
875  
876  
877  
878  
879  
880  
881  
882  
883  
884  
885  
886  
887  
888  
889  
890  
891  
892  
893  
894  
895  
896  
897  
898  
899  
900  
901  
902  
903  
904  
905  
906  
907  
908  
909  
910  
911  
912  
913  
914  
915  
916  
917  
918  
919  
920  
921  
922  
923  
924  
925  
926  
927  
928  
929  
930  
931  
932  
933  
934  
935  
936  
937  
938  
939  
940  
941  
942  
943  
944  
945  
946  
947  
948  
949  
950  
951  
952  
953  
954  
955  
956  
957  
958  
959  
960  
961  
962  
963  
964  
965  
966  
967  
968  
969  
970  
971  
972  
973  
974  
975  
976  
977  
978  
979  
980  
981  
982  
983  
984  
985  
986  
987  
988  
989  
990  
991  
992  
993  
994  
995  
996  
997  
998  
999  
1000

16 THE INTER TRIBAL COUNCIL OF ) No.  
17 ARIZONA, INC., THE LEAGUE OF )  
18 WOMEN VOTERS OF ARIZONA, THE )  
19 HOPI TRIBE, THE LEAGUE OF ) COMPLAINT FOR  
20 UNITED LATIN AMERICAN CITIZENS ) DECLARATORY AND  
21 ARIZONA, THE ARIZONA ) INJUNCTIVE RELIEF  
22 ADVOCACY NETWORK, THE PEOPLE )  
23 FOR THE AMERICAN WAY )  
24 FOUNDATION, and REP. STEVE M. )  
25 GALLARDO, )  
26 )  
27 )  
28 )  
29 )  
30 )  
31 )  
32 )  
33 )  
34 )  
35 )  
36 )  
37 )  
38 )  
39 )  
40 )  
41 )  
42 )  
43 )  
44 )  
45 )  
46 )  
47 )  
48 )  
49 )  
50 )  
51 )  
52 )  
53 )  
54 )  
55 )  
56 )  
57 )  
58 )  
59 )  
60 )  
61 )  
62 )  
63 )  
64 )  
65 )  
66 )  
67 )  
68 )  
69 )  
70 )  
71 )  
72 )  
73 )  
74 )  
75 )  
76 )  
77 )  
78 )  
79 )  
80 )  
81 )  
82 )  
83 )  
84 )  
85 )  
86 )  
87 )  
88 )  
89 )  
90 )  
91 )  
92 )  
93 )  
94 )  
95 )  
96 )  
97 )  
98 )  
99 )  
100 )  
101 )  
102 )  
103 )  
104 )  
105 )  
106 )  
107 )  
108 )  
109 )  
110 )  
111 )  
112 )  
113 )  
114 )  
115 )  
116 )  
117 )  
118 )  
119 )  
120 )  
121 )  
122 )  
123 )  
124 )  
125 )  
126 )  
127 )  
128 )  
129 )  
130 )  
131 )  
132 )  
133 )  
134 )  
135 )  
136 )  
137 )  
138 )  
139 )  
140 )  
141 )  
142 )  
143 )  
144 )  
145 )  
146 )  
147 )  
148 )  
149 )  
150 )  
151 )  
152 )  
153 )  
154 )  
155 )  
156 )  
157 )  
158 )  
159 )  
160 )  
161 )  
162 )  
163 )  
164 )  
165 )  
166 )  
167 )  
168 )  
169 )  
170 )  
171 )  
172 )  
173 )  
174 )  
175 )  
176 )  
177 )  
178 )  
179 )  
180 )  
181 )  
182 )  
183 )  
184 )  
185 )  
186 )  
187 )  
188 )  
189 )  
190 )  
191 )  
192 )  
193 )  
194 )  
195 )  
196 )  
197 )  
198 )  
199 )  
200 )  
201 )  
202 )  
203 )  
204 )  
205 )  
206 )  
207 )  
208 )  
209 )  
210 )  
211 )  
212 )  
213 )  
214 )  
215 )  
216 )  
217 )  
218 )  
219 )  
220 )  
221 )  
222 )  
223 )  
224 )  
225 )  
226 )  
227 )  
228 )  
229 )  
230 )  
231 )  
232 )  
233 )  
234 )  
235 )  
236 )  
237 )  
238 )  
239 )  
240 )  
241 )  
242 )  
243 )  
244 )  
245 )  
246 )  
247 )  
248 )  
249 )  
250 )  
251 )  
252 )  
253 )  
254 )  
255 )  
256 )  
257 )  
258 )  
259 )  
260 )  
261 )  
262 )  
263 )  
264 )  
265 )  
266 )  
267 )  
268 )  
269 )  
270 )  
271 )  
272 )  
273 )  
274 )  
275 )  
276 )  
277 )  
278 )  
279 )  
280 )  
281 )  
282 )  
283 )  
284 )  
285 )  
286 )  
287 )  
288 )  
289 )  
290 )  
291 )  
292 )  
293 )  
294 )  
295 )  
296 )  
297 )  
298 )  
299 )  
300 )  
301 )  
302 )  
303 )  
304 )  
305 )  
306 )  
307 )  
308 )  
309 )  
310 )  
311 )  
312 )  
313 )  
314 )  
315 )  
316 )  
317 )  
318 )  
319 )  
320 )  
321 )  
322 )  
323 )  
324 )  
325 )  
326 )  
327 )  
328 )  
329 )  
330 )  
331 )  
332 )  
333 )  
334 )  
335 )  
336 )  
337 )  
338 )  
339 )  
340 )  
341 )  
342 )  
343 )  
344 )  
345 )  
346 )  
347 )  
348 )  
349 )  
350 )  
351 )  
352 )  
353 )  
354 )  
355 )  
356 )  
357 )  
358 )  
359 )  
360 )  
361 )  
362 )  
363 )  
364 )  
365 )  
366 )  
367 )  
368 )  
369 )  
370 )  
371 )  
372 )  
373 )  
374 )  
375 )  
376 )  
377 )  
378 )  
379 )  
380 )  
381 )  
382 )  
383 )  
384 )  
385 )  
386 )  
387 )  
388 )  
389 )  
390 )  
391 )  
392 )  
393 )  
394 )  
395 )  
396 )  
397 )  
398 )  
399 )  
400 )  
401 )  
402 )  
403 )  
404 )  
405 )  
406 )  
407 )  
408 )  
409 )  
410 )  
411 )  
412 )  
413 )  
414 )  
415 )  
416 )  
417 )  
418 )  
419 )  
420 )  
421 )  
422 )  
423 )  
424 )  
425 )  
426 )  
427 )  
428 )  
429 )  
430 )  
431 )  
432 )  
433 )  
434 )  
435 )  
436 )  
437 )  
438 )  
439 )  
440 )  
441 )  
442 )  
443 )  
444 )  
445 )  
446 )  
447 )  
448 )  
449 )  
450 )  
451 )  
452 )  
453 )  
454 )  
455 )  
456 )  
457 )  
458 )  
459 )  
460 )  
461 )  
462 )  
463 )  
464 )  
465 )  
466 )  
467 )  
468 )  
469 )  
470 )  
471 )  
472 )  
473 )  
474 )  
475 )  
476 )  
477 )  
478 )  
479 )  
480 )  
481 )  
482 )  
483 )  
484 )  
485 )  
486 )  
487 )  
488 )  
489 )  
490 )  
491 )  
492 )  
493 )  
494 )  
495 )  
496 )  
497 )  
498 )  
499 )  
500 )  
501 )  
502 )  
503 )  
504 )  
505 )  
506 )  
507 )  
508 )  
509 )  
510 )  
511 )  
512 )  
513 )  
514 )  
515 )  
516 )  
517 )  
518 )  
519 )  
520 )  
521 )  
522 )  
523 )  
524 )  
525 )  
526 )  
527 )  
528 )  
529 )  
530 )  
531 )  
532 )  
533 )  
534 )  
535 )  
536 )  
537 )  
538 )  
539 )  
540 )  
541 )  
542 )  
543 )  
544 )  
545 )  
546 )  
547 )  
548 )  
549 )  
550 )  
551 )  
552 )  
553 )  
554 )  
555 )  
556 )  
557 )  
558 )  
559 )  
560 )  
561 )  
562 )  
563 )  
564 )  
565 )  
566 )  
567 )  
568 )  
569 )  
570 )  
571 )  
572 )  
573 )  
574 )  
575 )  
576 )  
577 )  
578 )  
579 )  
580 )  
581 )  
582 )  
583 )  
584 )  
585 )  
586 )  
587 )  
588 )  
589 )  
590 )  
591 )  
592 )  
593 )  
594 )  
595 )  
596 )  
597 )  
598 )  
599 )  
600 )  
601 )  
602 )  
603 )  
604 )  
605 )  
606 )  
607 )  
608 )  
609 )  
610 )  
611 )  
612 )  
613 )  
614 )  
615 )  
616 )  
617 )  
618 )  
619 )  
620 )  
621 )  
622 )  
623 )  
624 )  
625 )  
626 )  
627 )  
628 )  
629 )  
630 )  
631 )  
632 )  
633 )  
634 )  
635 )  
636 )  
637 )  
638 )  
639 )  
640 )  
641 )  
642 )  
643 )  
644 )  
645 )  
646 )  
647 )  
648 )  
649 )  
650 )  
651 )  
652 )  
653 )  
654 )  
655 )  
656 )  
657 )  
658 )  
659 )  
660 )  
661 )  
662 )  
663 )  
664 )  
665 )  
666 )  
667 )  
668 )  
669 )  
670 )  
671 )  
672 )  
673 )  
674 )  
675 )  
676 )  
677 )  
678 )  
679 )  
680 )  
681 )  
682 )  
683 )  
684 )  
685 )  
686 )  
687 )  
688 )  
689 )  
690 )  
691 )  
692 )  
693 )  
694 )  
695 )  
696 )  
697 )  
698 )  
699 )  
700 )  
701 )  
702 )  
703 )  
704 )  
705 )  
706 )  
707 )  
708 )  
709 )  
710 )  
711 )  
712 )  
713 )  
714 )  
715 )  
716 )  
717 )  
718 )  
719 )  
720 )  
721 )  
722 )  
723 )  
724 )  
725 )  
726 )  
727 )  
728 )  
729 )  
730 )  
731 )  
732 )  
733 )  
734 )  
735 )  
736 )  
737 )  
738 )  
739 )  
740 )  
741 )  
742 )  
743 )  
744 )  
745 )  
746 )  
747 )  
748 )  
749 )  
750 )  
751 )  
752 )  
753 )  
754 )  
755 )  
756 )  
757 )  
758 )  
759 )  
760 )  
761 )  
762 )  
763 )  
764 )  
765 )  
766 )  
767 )  
768 )  
769 )  
770 )  
771 )  
772 )  
773 )  
774 )  
775 )  
776 )  
777 )  
778 )  
779 )  
780 )  
781 )  
782 )  
783 )  
784 )  
785 )  
786 )  
787 )  
788 )  
789 )  
790 )  
791 )  
792 )  
793 )  
794 )  
795 )  
796 )  
797 )  
798 )  
799 )  
800 )  
801 )  
802 )  
803 )  
804 )  
805 )  
806 )  
807 )  
808 )  
809 )  
810 )  
811 )  
812 )  
813 )  
814 )  
815 )  
816 )  
817 )  
818 )  
819 )  
820 )  
821 )  
822 )  
823 )  
824 )  
825 )  
826 )  
827 )  
828 )  
829 )  
830 )  
831 )  
832 )  
833 )  
834 )  
835 )  
836 )  
837 )  
838 )  
839 )  
840 )  
841 )  
842 )  
843 )  
844 )  
845 )  
846 )  
847 )  
848 )  
849 )  
850 )  
851 )  
852 )  
853 )  
854 )  
855 )  
856 )  
857 )  
858 )  
859 )  
860 )  
861 )  
862 )  
863 )  
864 )  
865 )  
866 )  
867 )  
868 )  
869 )  
870 )  
871 )  
872 )  
873 )  
874 )  
875 )  
876 )  
877 )  
878 )  
879 )  
880 )  
881 )  
882 )  
883 )  
884 )  
885 )  
886 )  
887 )  
888 )  
889 )  
890 )  
891 )  
892 )  
893 )  
894 )  
895 )  
896 )  
897 )  
898 )  
899 )  
900 )  
901 )  
902 )  
903 )  
904 )  
905 )  
906 )  
907 )  
908 )  
909 )  
910 )  
911 )  
912 )  
913 )  
914 )  
915 )  
916 )  
917 )  
918 )  
919 )  
920 )  
921 )  
922 )  
923 )  
924 )  
925 )  
926 )  
927 )  
928 )  
929 )  
930 )  
931 )  
932 )  
933 )  
934 )  
935 )  
936 )  
937 )  
938 )  
939 )  
940 )  
941 )  
942 )  
943 )  
944 )  
945 )  
946 )  
947 )  
948 )  
949 )  
950 )  
951 )  
952 )  
953 )  
954 )  
955 )  
956 )  
957 )  
958 )  
959 )  
960 )  
961 )  
962 )  
963 )  
964 )  
965 )  
966 )  
967 )  
968 )  
969 )  
970 )  
971 )  
972 )  
973 )  
974 )  
975 )  
976 )  
977 )  
978 )  
979 )  
980 )  
981 )  
982 )  
983 )  
984 )  
985 )  
986 )  
987 )  
988 )  
989 )  
990 )  
991 )  
992 )  
993 )  
994 )  
995 )  
996 )  
997 )  
998 )  
999 )  
1000 )

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

## I. PRELIMINARY STATEMENT

This is an action to have the documentary proof of citizenship and polling place identification requirements of the “Arizona Taxpayer and Citizen Protection Act” (which appeared on the ballot in November 2004 as Proposition 200 and is referred to herein as “the Act”), amended Sections 16-152, 16-166, and 16-579 of the Arizona Revised Statutes, declared unconstitutional both facially and as applied, and to enjoin the further enforcement of these provisions of the Act on the ground that they impose an unauthorized and unnecessary burden on the fundamental right to vote in violation of the Fourteenth and Twenty-Fourth Amendments to the U.S. Constitution; the Civil Rights Act of 1964, 42 U.S.C. § 1971(a)(2)(A) and (a)(2)(B); and Section 2 of the Voting Rights Act of 1965, 42.U.S.C. § 1983(a). In addition, this action seeks declaratory and injunctive relief to enforce compliance with the National Voter Registration Act of 1993, 42 U.S.C. § 1973gg-4(a), which mandates that states “shall use and accept” the Federal Mail Voter Registration Form to register voters.

## II. PARTIES

### A. Plaintiffs

1. Plaintiff **Hopi Tribe** is a federally recognized Indian Tribe exercising powers which the Tribe now has under existing law or which were recognized by Congress by the Act of June 18, 1934. The Tribal Council is the governing body of the Hopi Tribe, duly recognized by the Secretary of Interior. The Council represents and speaks for the Hopi Tribe on all matters for the benefit and general welfare of the

1 Tribe and its Members. The Board of Elections of the Hopi Tribe conducts voter  
2 registration, educates Tribal Members about voter registration, encourages Tribal  
3 Members to exercise their right to vote, and works to ensure the voting rights of Hopi  
4 people in State, Federal and County elections. Voter registration is conducted in large  
5 part on the Hopi reservation, which is in an isolated, rural area. Many Hopi Tribal  
6 Members lack the identification required by the Act for registration and voting at the  
7 polling place. Moreover, obtaining the necessary identification will cause financial  
8 hardship because Tribal Members will have to expend time and money procuring the  
9 identification from designated agencies, most of which are at a great distance from the  
10 Hopi reservation. The Hopi Board of Elections uses the Federal Mail Voter  
11 Registration Form required by the National Voter Registration Act.  
12  
13  
14

15 2. Plaintiff **League of Women Voters of Arizona** (“LWVAZ”) is a  
16 nonpartisan political organization whose mission includes encouraging the informed  
17 and active participation by citizens in government at all levels, including the  
18 protection of the right of all citizens to vote and the education of voters about voting  
19 rights and procedures. LWVAZ has engaged and will engage in registering voters in  
20 Arizona. LWVAZ’s voter registration efforts include registering voters at public  
21 events (such as street fairs), school events (such as parents’ night at schools) and  
22 door-to-door.  
23  
24

25 3. Plaintiff **Inter Tribal Council of Arizona, Inc.** (“ITCA”) is a private,  
26 non-profit Arizona corporation established to provide its 20 member Tribes in  
27 Arizona with a means for action on matters that affect them collectively and  
28

1 individually. ITCA's mission is to provide its member tribes with a united voice and  
2 the means for united action on matters that affect them collectively or individually; to  
3 be the voice of the Member Tribes in bringing about Indian involvement and self-  
4 determination in order to improve the general welfare; to eliminate prejudice and  
5 discrimination against Indians and to improve the image of Indians held by non-  
6 Indians; to promote community development and enhance the quality of life for our  
7 Tribal members living in our communities; to empower our youth to be healthy in  
8 body, mind, and spirit and to make positive contributions for the well being of our  
9 communities; to defend human and civil rights as protected by law; to educate Indians  
10 and non-Indians about matters of concern to the Indians in Arizona through such  
11 means as public discussion groups, forums, panels, lectures, or any means possible  
12 and appropriate. ITCA's members include 20 Arizona Indian Tribes, Nations, and  
13 Communities, and each Tribe is represented in ITCA by its highest elected official.  
14 The Tribes are recognized by the United States under the Constitution by Treaties,  
15 Statutes, Executive Orders, the Secretary of the Interior and other actions by the  
16 United States. ITCA member Tribes occupy Reservations with land areas (including  
17 the Navajo Nation) of approximately a third of Arizona, or about 25 million acres.  
18 Indians were recognized as citizens of the United States by the Act of June 2, 1924,  
19 43 Stat. 253, 8 U.S.C. § 3. The ITCA operates projects and facilitates the formulation  
20 of public policy designed to strengthen the self-determination of Indian Tribal  
21 governments. For decades, ITCA has been involved in promoting Native American  
22 voting rights in Arizona and providing voter education programs for its Members.  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 Many individuals in the ITCA’s member Tribes cannot register to vote because they  
2 lack the identification required by the Act. Moreover, many individuals in the  
3 member Tribes cannot cast a ballot on election day because they lack the polling place  
4 identification required by the Act. Moreover, obtaining the necessary identification  
5 will cause financial hardship because individuals in ITCA’s member Tribes will have  
6 to expend time and money procuring the identification from various agencies, some of  
7 which are at a great distance from the reservations of the member Tribes.  
8  
9

10 4. Plaintiff **League of United Latin American Citizens (“LULAC”)**

11 **Arizona** is an Arizona-based branch of the organization founded in 1929 to advance  
12 the economic condition, educational attainment, political influence, health and civil  
13 rights, including voting rights, of the Hispanic population of the United States.  
14

15 LULAC’s activities in the state of Arizona include voter education and registration.

16 LULAC registers voters in Arizona at registration drives outside of retail stores,  
17 sporting venues, nightclubs, and at community parades and events. LULAC members  
18 will be affected by the Act’s identification requirements.  
19

20 5. Plaintiff **Arizona Advocacy Network (“AzAN”)** is a coalition of

21 nonprofit public interest organizations dedicated to increasing citizen participation in  
22 the political process. AzAN promotes social, economic, racial and environmental  
23 justice by connecting and building power among activists and leaders in those fields,  
24 and by leading efforts for electoral justice and increased civic participation. Towards  
25 that end, AzAN’s scope of work includes, among other goals, protecting and  
26 improving citizen access to voting by working to diminish limitations and restrictions  
27  
28

1 on registration and voting, extending registration to vote up to and including election  
2 days, promoting voting by mail, and ending the requirement of documentary proof of  
3 citizenship at polling places and for voter registration. AzAN has conducted and will  
4 conduct voter registration in Arizona, and is particularly focused on registering  
5 underrepresented communities and thereby engaging those communities in civic  
6 participation.  
7

8  
9 6. Plaintiff **People For the American Way (“PFAWF”) Foundation** is a  
10 nonpartisan non-profit corporation committed to promoting values and institutions  
11 that sustain a diverse democratic society and an informed electorate, and whose  
12 efforts include voter education and registration in Arizona through a project focused  
13 on Hispanic citizens. PFAWF has conducted and will conduct voter registration in  
14 Arizona.  
15

16 7. Plaintiff **Steve M. Gallardo** is an Arizona State House Representative  
17 for District 13. Mr. Gallardo was elected in 2002. Mr. Gallardo engages in election  
18 campaigns, seeks the votes of eligible, registered voters, and seeks to ensure that the  
19 voting rights of all eligible citizens are protected, and that no eligible voters are  
20 discouraged or prevented from registering to vote or casting a ballot. Mr. Gallardo  
21 seeks to correctly inform eligible citizens about the identification required to register  
22 to vote, and to correctly inform registered voters about the identification necessary to  
23 cast a ballot. Voters who would vote for Mr. Gallardo in upcoming elections, but lack  
24 the registration and/or polling place identification required by the Act, will not be able  
25 to cast their vote for Mr. Gallardo. As a result, Mr. Gallardo will receive fewer votes.  
26  
27  
28

1 Some of Mr. Gallardo's constituents cannot register because they lack the  
2 identification required by the Act. Some of Mr. Gallardo's constituents cannot cast a  
3 ballot because they lack the polling place identification required by the Act.  
4 Obtaining the necessary identification will cause financial hardship because such  
5 constituents will have to expend time and money procuring the identification required  
6 by the Act from various designated agencies. Finally, some of Mr. Gallardo's  
7 constituents, who have secured or could secure the identification required by the Act,  
8 through inadvertence, may prove unable to present the identification required by the  
9 Act at the time of voting.  
10  
11

12 8. ITCA, the Hopi Tribe, and LULAC have members who would have  
13 standing to sue in their individual right for the allegations set forth in the Complaint,  
14 the interests that ITCA, the Hopi Tribe, LULAC and their members seek to protect in  
15 the Complaint are germane to the purpose of each of each organization, and neither  
16 the claim nor the relief sought requires participation by the individual members of  
17 ITCA, the Hopi Tribe, and LULAC.  
18  
19

### 20 C. Defendant

21 9. **Secretary of State Jan Brewer** is in her official capacity as the  
22 Secretary of State of Arizona, in which capacity she is the chief state election officer  
23 under A.R.S. § 16-142.  
24

### 25 III. JURISDICTION AND VENUE

26 10. This case arises under the Constitution, laws, or treaties of the United  
27 States. This Court has subject matter jurisdiction over this action under 28 U.S.C. §§  
28

1 1331, 1343(a)(3) and (4) § 1361, and 28 U.S.C. § 1367(a), and 42 U.S.C. §§ 1971(d),  
2 1973j(f) and 1983. This Court has jurisdiction to grant both declaratory and  
3 injunctive relief under 28 U.S.C. §§ 2201 and 2202.  
4

5 11. Venue in this district and division is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b)  
6 because defendant Brewer resides and may be found in this district, and a substantial  
7 part of the events giving rise to the claim occurred in this district.  
8

#### 9 10 11 12 **IV. FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS**

##### 13 **A. Pre-Existing Arizona Law**

14  
15 12. Arizona has a history of widespread and persistent discrimination in  
16 voting through practices and procedures that unconstitutionally interfere with the  
17 fundamental right to vote guaranteed by the Constitution. In 1975, Congress  
18 recognized Arizona's discriminatory by requiring Arizona to prove that proposed  
19 voting changes do not deny or abridge the right to vote on account of race, color, or  
20 membership in a language minority group pursuant to Section 5 of the Voting Rights  
21 Act. 42 U.S.C. § 1973c.  
22

23  
24 13. Prior to the enactment of the Act, a person registering to vote in Arizona  
25 was required to sign a statement declaring that he or she is a United States citizen and  
26 acknowledging that executing a false registration is a class 6 felony. Registrants were  
27  
28

1 not required to submit other documentary proof of United States citizenship with their  
2 registration applications. A.R.S. § 16-152 (amended 2004).

3  
4 14. Prior to 2003, registered voters in Arizona were not required to present  
5 any form of identification at the polls as a condition of casting a ballot. A.R.S. § 16-  
6 579 (amended 2004).

7  
8 15. Effective November 2003, A.R.S. §16-579 was amended in order to  
9 comply with the requirements of the Help American Vote Act. The amendments  
10 provided that if a statewide voter registration database was not yet operational at the  
11 time of an election, certain identification requirements would apply to voters who  
12 registered by mail after January 1, 2003 or reregistered by mail after that date after  
13 moving from one Arizona county to another.

14  
15 **B. The Arizona Taxpayer and Citizen Protection Act (“Proposition 200”)**

16 16. In November 2004, Arizona voters approved the Arizona Taxpayer and  
17 Citizen Protection Act (“Proposition 200”), a ballot initiative which, according to the  
18 “findings and declaration” section of the initiative, was designed to “discourage  
19 illegal immigration.” The Act in large measure addresses issues unrelated to voting,  
20 namely: requiring that state and local governments verify the identity of applicants  
21 for certain public benefits, and requiring that government employees report alleged  
22 violations of immigration law by applicants for public benefits. The Act also amended  
23 three sections of the Arizona Revised Statutes pertaining to voting: A.R.S. §§ 16-152,  
24 16-166, and 16-579. The Act imposed a new proof of citizenship requirement for  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 voter registration, as well as new requirements for presenting identification at the  
2 polling place in order to receive and cast a ballot.

3  
4 ***The New Proof of Citizenship Requirement for Voter Registration***

5 17. The Act amended A.R.S. §§ 16-152 and 16-166 to require that an  
6 individual who applies to register to vote must submit proof of United States  
7 citizenship with the application, and that a county recorder must reject any application  
8 for registration that is not accompanied by “satisfactory evidence” of citizenship as  
9 specified by A.R.S. § 16-166(F). Such “satisfactory evidence” includes:  
10

11 a) The number of the applicant’s driver’s license or non-operating  
12 identification license if issued after October 1, 1996 by the Department of  
13 Transportation or the equivalent governmental agency of another state within the  
14 United States if the agency indicates on the applicant’s driver’s license or non-  
15 operating identification license that the person has provided satisfactory proof of  
16 United States citizenship.  
17

18 b) A legible photocopy of the applicant’s birth certificate that  
19 verifies citizenship to the satisfaction of the county recorder.  
20

21 c) A legible photocopy of pertinent pages of the applicant’s United  
22 States passport identifying the applicant and the applicant’s passport number or  
23 presentation to the county recorder of the applicant’s United States passport.  
24

25 d) A presentation to the county recorder of the applicant’s United  
26 States naturalization documents or the number of certificate of naturalization. If only  
27 the number of the certificate of naturalization is provided, the applicant shall not be  
28

1 included in the registration rolls until the number of the certificate of naturalization is  
2 verified with the United States Immigration and Naturalization Service by the County  
3 Recorder.  
4

5 e) Other documents or methods of proof that are established  
6 pursuant to the Immigration Reform and Control Act of 1986.

7 f) The applicant's Bureau of Indian Affairs card number, Tribal  
8 treaty number or Tribal enforcement number. A.R.S. § 16-166(F).  
9

10 18. The Act includes a "grandfather" clause that provides that a person who  
11 was registered to vote in Arizona on the effective date of the amendment to A.R.S. §  
12 16-166 is deemed to have provided satisfactory evidence of citizenship, and is not  
13 required to resubmit evidence of citizenship unless he or she changes voter  
14 registration from one county to another. A.R.S. § 16-166(G).  
15

16 19. A.R.S. § 16-166(F), as amended by the Act, further provides that proof  
17 of voter registration from another state or Arizona county is not satisfactory evidence  
18 of citizenship. Therefore, an individual who moves from one Arizona county to  
19 another Arizona county must resubmit "satisfactory evidence" of United States  
20 citizenship in order to register to vote in his or her new county of residence. A.R.S.  
21 §§ 16-166(H).  
22

23 20. Because Arizona is covered under § 5 of the Voting Rights Act, it  
24 cannot implement a change in voting absent federal preclearance. Arizona's proof of  
25 citizenship requirement for voter registration was precleared by the U.S. Department  
26 of Justice on January 24, 2005, and the Arizona Voter Registration Form was  
27  
28

1 precleared on May 6, 2005. Preclearance does not bar a subsequent action to enjoin  
2 enforcement of a voting qualification, standard, practice or procedure. 42 U.S.C. §  
3 1973(c).  
4

5 ***The New Polling Place Identification Requirements***

6 21. The Act also amended A.R.S. § 16-579 to require that all registered  
7 Arizona voters appearing at the polls to vote must satisfy new identification  
8 requirements before they will be allowed to cast a ballot. A voter who appears at a  
9 polling place to cast a ballot must present either one form of identification that bears  
10 the name, current address, and photograph of the voter, or two other forms of  
11 identification that bear the name and current address of the voter. A.R.S. § 16-  
12 579(A).  
13  
14

15 22. Defendant Brewer has promulgated rules to implement the polling place  
16 identification requirements of the Act. These regulations were precleared by the  
17 Department of Justice on October 7, 2005.  
18

19 23. In a document entitled, “Procedure for Proof of Identification at the  
20 Polls,” dated September 6, 2005, posted on the Secretary of State’s website, the forms  
21 of polling place identification deemed “acceptable” by the Secretary of State are  
22 identified as follows:  
23

24 **Acceptable forms of identification with photograph, name, and address of  
the elector**

- 25 • Valid Arizona driver license
- 26 • Valid Arizona nonoperating identification license
- 27 • Tribal enrollment card or other form of Tribal identification
- 28 • Valid United States federal, state, or local government issued  
identification

1  
2 **Acceptable forms of identification without a photograph that bear the**  
3 **name and address of the elector (two required)**

- 4
- Utility bill of the elector that is dated within ninety days of the date of the election. A utility bill may be for electric, gas, water, solid waste, sewer, telephone, cellular phone, or cable television
  - Bank or credit union statement that is dated within ninety days of the date of the election
  - Valid Arizona Vehicle Registration
  - Indian Census Card
  - Property tax statement of the elector’s residence
  - Tribal enrollment card or other form of Tribal identification
  - Vehicle insurance card
  - Recorder’s Certificate
  - Valid United States federal, state, or local government issued identification, including a voter registration card issued by the county recorder.

5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13 The identification set forth above is “valid” unless it can be determined on its face  
14 that it has expired.

15  
16 According to the above-referenced document, “Procedure for Proof of  
17 Identification at the Polls,” the foregoing list of “acceptable” proof of identification is  
18 not exhaustive. However, other forms of identification not on the foregoing list must  
19 be deemed acceptable by the county official in charge of elections and must establish  
20 the identity of the elector in accordance with the requirements of A.R.S. § 16-579(A).

21  
22 24. According to the Secretary of State’s regulations, electors who do not  
23 provide the identification required by A.R.S. § 16-579(A) must be issued a  
24 provisional ballot, and must be instructed by a poll worker that, in order for the  
25 provisional ballot to be processed and counted, the elector must provide the  
26 identification required by A.R.S. § 16-579(A) to the county recorder’s office by 5:00  
27  
28

1 p.m. on the fifth business day after a general election that includes an election for  
2 federal office or 5:00 p.m. on the third business day after any other election.

3  
4 25. The new identification requirements imposed by the Act apply only to  
5 registered voters who vote *in person* on Election Day. The Arizona Taxpayer and  
6 Citizen Protection Act did not affect Arizona’s early voting provisions.

7  
8 26. All Arizona elections must provide for early voting and any qualified  
9 elector may vote by early ballot. A.R.S. § 16-541. Except for first-time voters as set  
10 forth in A.R.S. § 16-542(A), electors who vote by early ballot are not required to  
11 satisfy the identification requirements imposed by the Act. Rather, to obtain an early  
12 ballot, a voter is required only to submit along with his or her request for an early  
13 ballot “the date of birth and state or country of birth or other information that if  
14 compared to the voter registration information on file would confirm the identity of  
15 the elector.” A.R.S. § 16-542(A). After the voter completes the early ballot and  
16 executes an affidavit on an accompanying envelope that attests to the voter’s identity,  
17 the early voter may deliver or mail the ballot to the county recorder or other officer in  
18 charge of elections. A.R.S. § 16-547, 16-548. The county recorder is required to  
19 review the signature on the completed affidavit to ensure that it corresponds to the  
20 signature of the elector on his or her registration form, and if the voter’s affidavit is  
21 sufficient, the vote shall be allowed. A.R.S. § 16-550, 16-552(A). Except as noted  
22 above, an early voter is not required to satisfy the polling place identification  
23 requirements imposed by the Act. Moreover, according to the Secretary of State’s  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 regulations, “[a]n elector who is dropping off his or her early ballot at a precinct  
2 voting location is not required to show identification.”

3  
4 **C. Proposition 200’s Proof of Citizenship and Polling Place Identification**  
5 **Requirements Impose an Unnecessary and Undue Restriction on the**  
6 **Fundamental Right to Vote**

7 27. The proof of citizenship requirement of the Act, A.R.S. §§ 16-152 and  
8 16-166, as amended, imposes an unnecessary and undue burden on the exercise of the  
9 fundamental right to vote of thousands of citizens of Arizona who are fully eligible  
10 and qualified to register to vote, but who either do not possess or are unable to access  
11 the documents specified as “satisfactory evidence” of citizenship by A.R.S. § 16-  
12 166(F), as amended, and, accordingly, will be disenfranchised. Individual members  
13 of LULAC, the Hopi Tribe, and individuals in ITCA’s member Tribes will be injured  
14 by the Act’s proof of citizenship requirements, for the reasons discussed below.

15 28. Indian reservations in Arizona, including the reservation of ITCA  
16 Member Tribes, encompass approximately 25 million acres. Thousands of individual  
17 Members of the ITCA’s Member Tribes who are residents of the reservations live in  
18 remote areas, and many have no running water, electricity, telephone, gas services,  
19 bank accounts, home addresses, drivers’ licenses, automobiles, or access to public  
20 transportation. The ITCA Tribes have the highest unemployment rates in the nation.  
21 Unemployment ranges up to 82% on some reservations. Many Members of the  
22 ITCA’s Member Tribes live in such poor housing conditions that paper documents  
23 proving citizenship are difficult to impossible to preserve.  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1           29.    Thousands of citizens of Arizona are eligible and qualified to register to  
2 vote, but do not have one of the items required by § 16-166(F): a driver’s license or  
3 non-operating identification license issued after October 1, 1996 by Arizona or  
4 another state indicating citizenship; a photocopy of a birth certificate or a passport;  
5 naturalization or other documents established pursuant to the Immigration Reform and  
6 Control Act of 1996; or Tribal documentation. Many U.S. citizens, by necessity or  
7 choice, do not have driver’s licenses. Moreover, many citizens do not have passports,  
8 either because their health or financial situation makes it difficult for them to travel  
9 abroad, or simply because they choose not to. Many citizens, furthermore, either do  
10 not possess or do not have access to a copy of their birth certificate. In addition, the  
11 naturalization or Tribal documentation referenced in § 16-166(F) may not be  
12 applicable to many Arizona citizens.

16           30.    While the new voter registration provisions of the Act will burden all  
17 registrants, compliance with these provisions will impose an especially difficult  
18 obstacle for citizens who are eligible and qualified to register, but who are: (a) poor  
19 and therefore do not own a vehicle, do not have a passport because they cannot afford  
20 to travel abroad, and do not have possess or have access to a birth certificate; (b)  
21 elderly and no longer drive, no longer have a passport because they do not travel  
22 abroad, and do not possess or have access to a birth certificate; (c) physically disabled  
23 and therefore do not drive, and either by necessity or choice do not travel abroad on a  
24 passport, and do not possess or have access to a birth certificate; (d) residents of  
25 retirement and nursing homes who, by choice or necessity, do not have driver’s  
26  
27  
28

1 licenses or passports, and do not possess or have access to a birth certificate; (e)  
2 married women who have changed their names; and (f) individuals who live in rural  
3 areas for whom providing a photocopy of the required documentation would impose a  
4 hardship.  
5

6 31. Moreover, the Act's requirement that citizens provide documentary  
7 proof of citizenship in order to register will significantly hamper the voter registration  
8 efforts of organizations that conduct voter registration in Arizona, including plaintiffs  
9 the Hopi Tribe, LWVAZ, LULAC, AzAN, PFAWF, and ITCA. The Act's citizenship  
10 documentation requirement will make it extremely difficult for voter registration  
11 organizations to register individuals in public places (such as shopping malls, fairs,  
12 etc.) because individuals typically do not carry birth certificates or passports on their  
13 persons, and because of the general unavailability of photocopying machines at such  
14 public places. Moreover, the Act's citizenship documentation requirement will make  
15 it extremely difficult for voter registration organizations to conduct door-to-door voter  
16 registration drives because households typically do not have photocopying machines,  
17 and such machines cannot be moved from house to house. In sum, the Act limits the  
18 number of persons who can be registered, and hinders the organizations' ability to  
19 conduct voter registration.  
20  
21  
22

23 32. The Act will deplete the resources of voter registration organizations  
24 who will be forced to copy, assist in copying, and transport for copying  
25 documentation establishing citizenship, such as birth certificates and passports. The  
26 Plaintiff organizations, including the ITCA, Hopi Tribe, LWVAZ, LULAC, AzAN,  
27  
28

1 PFAWF, and ITCA will be required to shift limited resources away from their  
2 respective existing programs and voting outreach efforts and apply such resources to  
3 helping their members comply with the Act's identification requirements. Plaintiff  
4 organizations, including the Hopi Tribe, LWVAZ, LULAC, AzAN, PFAWF, and  
5 ITCA's have an interest in accurately informing their members and constituencies of  
6 the identification required to register to vote and to cast a ballot. This ability is  
7 hindered by the Act's requirements, and by Secretary Brewer's refusal to use the  
8 Federal Mail Voter Registration Form prescribed by the U.S. Election Assistance  
9 Commission for registration of voters in federal elections, as described more fully  
10 below.

11  
12  
13  
14 33. The new polling place identification requirements of A.R.S. § 16-579,  
15 as amended, as well as the Secretary of State's implementing regulations, also impose  
16 an unnecessary and undue burden on the exercise of the fundamental right to vote of  
17 thousands of qualified voters in Arizona who do not possess or are unable to access  
18 the documents deemed "acceptable" proof of identification, including members of  
19 LULAC, the Hopi Tribe, and the individual members of the ITCA's member Tribes.

20  
21 34. Thousands of Arizona citizens are eligible and qualified voter  
22 registrants but have neither a form of photo identification with a current address, nor  
23 two forms of non-photo identification with a current address, that have been deemed  
24 "acceptable" by defendant Brewer or their county election official. Many registered  
25 and qualified electors do not have a driver's license, or do not have a driver's license  
26 with a current address. Moreover, many qualified electors do not possess photo  
27  
28

1 identification issued by the federal, state or local government with a current address.  
2 With respect to non-photo identification, many electors – including those who are  
3 poor and/or elderly, who live in assisted living facilities, who live on reservations  
4 and/or in rural areas without conventional addresses, who do not possess a vehicle or  
5 real property, and who do not have a bank account or utility account in their own  
6 name – will be unable to present the identification required at the polling place and,  
7 accordingly, will be disenfranchised.  
8  
9

10 35. The burdens imposed by the polling place identification requirement  
11 affect a wide spectrum of Arizona’s registered voters, such as:

12 1) Voters who are poor, do not own a vehicle, and lack a driver’s license  
13 or other government-issued photo identification, and therefore are very unlikely to  
14 have a vehicle insurance card or Arizona vehicle registration, and are less likely to  
15 have two recent utility bills or bank statements in their names;  
16

17 2) Residents of assisted living facilities who may not have driver’s  
18 licenses, either because they are unable to drive or simply choose not to, and are  
19 less likely to have vehicle insurance cards, vehicle registration documents, or recent  
20 utility bills in their names.  
21

22 3) Registered voters who do not drive and whose household utility bills  
23 and other documents are in the name of the voter’s spouse;  
24

25 4) Native American voters, particularly those who live on reservations  
26 and/or in rural areas, and who may not have conventional addresses or documents  
27  
28

1 bearing their address, and who may not have bank statements or utility bills in their  
2 name;

3  
4 5) Students who do not drive and whose student identification cards lack  
5 addresses and/or are issued by private colleges or universities, and who do not have  
6 utility bills in their names because they share such costs with parents and/or  
7 roommates; and

8  
9 6) Women who recently married and changed their name but whose  
10 identification documents do not yet reflect that change.

11  
12 **D. The Fees Necessary to Obtain the Documents Deemed To Be “Satisfactory**  
13 **Evidence” of Citizenship by A.R.S. § 16-166(F), and “Acceptable” Proof of**  
14 **Identification Pursuant to A.R.S. § 16-579 Are a Poll Tax On the Right to Vote**

15 36. The fees necessary to obtain the documents deemed to be “satisfactory  
16 evidence” of citizenship by A.R.S. § 16-166, as amended, and “acceptable” proof of  
17 identification under A.R.S. § 16-579, as amended, constitute a poll tax on the right to  
18 vote because, for individuals lacking these documents, including members of the Hopi  
19 Tribe, LULAC and individuals in the ITCA’s member Tribes, such fees are a  
20 financial condition for the right to vote.

21  
22 37. Arizona citizens who are qualified and eligible and desire to register to  
23 vote, but who lack one of the documents evidencing citizenship required by A.R.S. §  
24 16-166, and for whom the naturalization, immigration and Tribal documents  
25 referenced in that provision are inapplicable, will be required to either: (a) apply for  
26 an Arizona driver’s license or state identification card by traveling to a Motor Vehicle  
27  
28

1 Division office, presenting required identification (such as an original birth certificate  
2 or Social Security card), and paying a fee that ranges from ten dollars (\$10.00) to  
3 twenty-five dollars (\$25.00), depending on the applicants age; (b) apply for a birth  
4 certificate copy from the Arizona Division of Public Health Services (or the  
5 equivalent agency of the person’s state of birth), which application must include a  
6 copy of government-issued photo identification (such as a driver’s license) and  
7 payment of fifteen dollars (\$15.00) for births occurring prior to 1990; or (c) apply for  
8 a U.S. passport by traveling to a designated office, presenting appropriate  
9 documentation (such as a birth certificate), and two photographs, and paying ninety-  
10 seven dollars (\$97.00) in fees and surcharges.

13           38. Arizona citizens who are registered to vote and desire to cast a ballot at  
14 the polling place on election day, but who lack one of the polling place identification  
15 documents deemed “acceptable” under A.R.S. 16-579, will be required to either: (a)  
16 apply for an Arizona driver’s license or state identification card by undergoing the  
17 process and paying the fees described above; or (b) open a utility account or bank  
18 account in their name and paying the associated fees. Even registered voters who  
19 have driver’s licenses or non-operating licenses may not have updated the cards to  
20 reflect their current address, as this is not required by Arizona law; doing so will  
21 require payment of a four dollar (\$4.00) fee.

22           39. The new voting registration and voting provisions of the Act impose an  
23 undue burden on the right of voters, including individual members of LULAC, the  
24 Hopi Tribe, and ITCA’s member Tribes, who will be required to expend time and  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 money in order to obtain the specified documents needed to register to vote and cast a  
2 ballot.

3  
4 **E. Arizona’s Asserted Interest in “Discouraging Illegal Immigration” Does Not**  
5 **Justify the Severe Burden on the Fundamental Right to Vote Imposed by the**  
6 **Arizona Taxpayer and Citizen Protection Act**

7 40. The Supreme Court has held that:

8 A court considering a challenge to a state election law must  
9 weigh “the character and magnitude of the asserted injury to the rights  
10 protected by the [Constitution] that the plaintiff seeks to vindicate”  
11 against “the precise interests put forward by the State as justifications  
12 for the burden imposed by the rule,” taking into consideration “the  
13 extent to which those interests make it necessary to burden the  
14 plaintiff’s rights.”

15 *Burdick v. Takushi*, 504 U.S. 428, 434 (1992)(quoting *Anderson v. Celebrezze*,  
16 460 U.S. 780, 789 (1983); *Tashjian v. Republican Party of Connecticut*, 479 U.S. 208,  
17 213-14 (1986)).

18 41. The state interest put forward by the proponents of the Arizona  
19 Taxpayer and Citizen Protection Act in the ballot measure’s “findings and  
20 declaration” section relate to the purported economic hardship to the State caused by  
21 the provision of public benefits to undocumented immigrants. The “findings and  
22 declaration” section of the Act asserts: “Therefore, the people of this state declare  
23 that the public interest of this state requires all public agencies within this state to  
24 cooperate with federal immigration authorities to discourage illegal immigration.”  
25 Nowhere in its “findings and declaration” section does Proposition 200 mention  
26 voting.

27 42. The burden upon Arizona citizens’ right to vote imposed by the Act’s  
28 new proof of citizenship requirement for voter registration is unnecessary, and

1 unjustified by evidence of significant voting by “illegal immigrants” or non-citizens  
2 in Arizona.

3  
4 43. There is no evidence that the procedures in place prior to the enactment  
5 of the Act for preventing undocumented immigrants or non-citizens from voting were  
6 inadequate. In this regard, the Federal Mail Voter Registration Form (“Federal  
7 Registration Form” or “Federal Form”) prescribed by the U.S. Election Assistance  
8 Commission (“EAC”), which states are required to use and accept for the registration  
9 of voters in elections for federal office pursuant to the National Voter Registration  
10 Act (“NVRA”), 42 U.S.C. § 1973gg-4(a), does not require a registrant to provide  
11 documentary evidence of citizenship.  
12

13  
14 44. Arizona law already protects against the unauthorized voter registration  
15 of undocumented immigrants or non-citizens. Arizona law, both prior to the  
16 enactment of Proposition 200 as well as currently, criminalizes the false voter  
17 registration of persons not entitled to register. Under A.R.S. § 16-182, “[a] person  
18 who knowingly causes, procures or allows himself to be registered as an elector of  
19 any county, city, town, district or precinct, knowing that he is not entitled to such  
20 registration, or any person who knowingly causes or procures another person to be  
21 registered ....knowing that such other person is not entitled to such registration, ....is  
22 guilty of a class 6 felony.” A.R.S. § 16-183. The term of imprisonment for a class 6  
23 felony is one year. A.R.S. § 13-701(C)(5).  
24

25  
26 45. There is no evidence that the procedures in place prior to the Act for  
27 preventing undocumented immigrants or non-citizens from registering to vote resulted  
28

1 in substantial numbers of undocumented immigrants or non-citizens on the voting  
2 rolls. Moreover, to the extent that undocumented immigrants or non-citizens were  
3 registered to vote as a result of procedures in effect prior to the enactment of the Act  
4 (which plaintiffs dispute), the Act is a wholly ineffective and inappropriate solution  
5 due, in part, because of the Act’s “grandfather” clause. Pursuant to the Act, a person  
6 who was registered to vote in Arizona on the effective date of the amendment to  
7 A.R.S. § 16-166 is deemed to have provided satisfactory evidence of citizenship, and  
8 is not required to resubmit evidence of citizenship. A.R.S. § 16-166(G). If the  
9 procedures in place prior to the enactment of the Act resulted in undocumented  
10 immigrants and non-citizens being included on the voter registration rolls, it makes no  
11 sense for the State to grandfather in these alleged undocumented immigrants and non-  
12 citizens by specifically exempting them from the requirement of producing  
13 documentation of citizenship.  
14

15  
16  
17 46. Even if the citizenship documentation provision of the Act had been  
18 truly intended to prevent undocumented immigrants or non-citizens from registering  
19 to vote, the citizenship documentation provision is overbroad and not narrowly  
20 tailored. It is overbroad because it applies to and burdens the right to vote of the  
21 overwhelming majority of qualified and eligible citizens who attempt to register to  
22 vote in order to prevent a hypothetical miniscule fraction of people from illegally  
23 registering. Moreover, it is not narrowly tailored to prevent or deter continued voting  
24 by any alleged undocumented immigrants or non-citizens who were registered prior to  
25 the effective date of Proposition 200.  
26  
27  
28

1           47.     The burden upon Arizona citizens' right to vote imposed by the Act's  
2 new polling place voter identification provisions is unnecessary, and unjustified by  
3 evidence of significant voting by undocumented immigrants or non-citizens in  
4 Arizona, or other fraudulent voting.  
5

6           48.     There is no evidence of substantial numbers of undocumented  
7 immigrants or non-citizens voting in Arizona elections. Even if such evidence existed  
8 (which Plaintiffs dispute), the Act's polling place voter identification requirements are  
9 not an effective or appropriate solution to prevent such illegal voting because many of  
10 the documents deemed acceptable proof of identification under A.R.S. § 16-579 (e.g.,  
11 utility bills, bank statements), do not establish U.S. citizenship.  
12

13           49.     To the extent that the State attempts to justify the polling place voter  
14 identification requirements of the Act on the grounds that they are necessary to  
15 prevent voter fraud in general, there is no evidence of such fraud in Arizona that  
16 would justify the disenfranchisement of Arizona citizens caused by the polling place  
17 identification requirements. Specifically, there is no evidence of substantial numbers  
18 of voters in Arizona appearing at polling places and impersonating registered voters,  
19 such that the restrictive and disenfranchising identification requirements of the Act  
20 are justified.  
21

22           50.     There is no evidence that existing provisions of Arizona law have been  
23 ineffective in deterring and preventing imposters from fraudulently obtaining and  
24 casting ballots at the polls by misrepresenting their true identities to election officials  
25 and passing themselves off as registered voters whose names appear on the official  
26  
27  
28

1 voter registration list. Pursuant to Arizona law, a person who, not being entitled to  
2 vote, knowingly votes, is guilty of a class 5 felony, punishable by imprisonment for  
3 one and one-half years. A.R.S. § 16-1016, § 13-701. Thus, fraudulent voting was  
4 already prohibited by existing Arizona law without unduly burdening the right of a  
5 citizen to vote.  
6

7           51. Even if there were evidence in Arizona of significant voter fraud by  
8 impersonation of registered voters (which plaintiffs dispute), the Arizona Taxpayer  
9 and Citizen Protection Act is not an effective or appropriate solution to prevent such  
10 fraud because it creates a loophole for early voters. With the exception of first-time  
11 voters as set forth in A.R.S. § 16-542(A), electors who vote by early ballot in Arizona  
12 are not required to satisfy the identification requirements imposed by the Act, and  
13 thus the Act is ineffective at preventing fraudulent voting by imposters.  
14  
15

16           52. Even if the polling place voter identification provision of the Act had  
17 been truly intended to prevent fraudulent voting by imposters (which plaintiffs  
18 dispute), the polling place identification provision is overbroad and not narrowly  
19 tailored. It is overbroad because it applies to and burdens the right to vote of the  
20 overwhelming majority of citizens who cast their ballots in person at the polling place  
21 in order to prevent a hypothetical miniscule fraction of people from fraudulently  
22 casting ballots by misrepresenting their identities to poll workers. Moreover, it is not  
23 narrowly tailored to prevent or deter fraudulent voting by early voting.  
24  
25

26           53. In summary, the amendments to Arizona’s election laws brought about  
27 by the Act do nothing to further the State’s purported interest in “discouraging illegal  
28

1 immigration.” Nor is there evidence of unauthorized voting by undocumented  
2 immigrants or non-citizens, or voter fraud generally, that would justify these  
3 substantial burdens on the fundamental right to vote. Even if the proof of citizenship  
4 and polling place voter identification provisions of the Act had been truly intended to  
5 effect legitimate state interests relating to voter registration and voting, those  
6 provisions are overbroad and are not narrowly tailored.  
7  
8  
9  
10

11 **F. The Arizona Taxpayer and Citizen Protection Act Will Have A Disparate**  
12 **Impact on Native American and Latino Voters**

13 54. The voter registration and voting provisions of the Act will have a  
14 disparate impact on the ability of voter registrants and voters who are Latino or Native  
15 American, because Latinos and Native Americans in Arizona, on average, are (a) less  
16 affluent than whites, when evaluated through a number of statistical measures,  
17 including median household income, per capita income, and percent of persons below  
18 the poverty line and (b) are less likely to own or have access to a motor vehicle than  
19 whites according to recent data published by the U.S. Census Bureau. Moreover,  
20 Native Americans are more likely to live in rural locations at a greater distance to the  
21 polls, and have unconventional addresses or no formal street address at all.  
22  
23

24 **G. The National Voter Registration Act Requires States to Accept the**  
25 **Federal Mail Voter Registration Form, and Does Not Permit A State to**  
26 **Condition Acceptance of the Form on Submission of Supplemental Evidence of**  
27 **Citizenship**  
28

1           55. States are required by the National Voter Registration Act (“NVRA”),  
2 42 U.S.C. § 1973gg-4(a), to accept and use the Federal Mail Voter Registration Form  
3 (“Federal Registration Form” or “Federal Form”) prescribed by the U.S. Election  
4 Assistance Commission (“EAC”) for the registration of voters in elections for Federal  
5 office. 42 U.S.C. §1973gg-4(a). The Federal Registration Form prescribed by the  
6 EAC requires that a registrant attest that he or she is a United States citizen, but does  
7 not require the registrant to supplement the Federal Form with documentary evidence  
8 of citizenship.  
9

10  
11           56. By letter to defendant Brewer, dated March 6, 2006, from the EAC’s  
12 Executive Director, Thomas R. Wilkey, the U.S. Election Assistance Commission  
13 rejected a request by defendant Brewer’s office to apply the proof of citizenship  
14 requirements derived from the Arizona Taxpayer and Citizen Protection Act to the  
15 Federal Form registration process. The EAC advised defendant Brewer that “[n]o  
16 state may condition acceptance of the Federal Form upon receipt of additional proof”  
17 of voter qualification. Accordingly, the EAC advised defendant Brewer that “Arizona  
18 may not refuse to register individuals to vote in a Federal election for failing to  
19 provide supplemental proof of citizenship, if they have properly completed and timely  
20 submitted the Federal Registration Form,” and that Arizona’s refusal to register such  
21 individuals would violate the NVRA.  
22  
23

24  
25           57. Notwithstanding the EAC’s rejection of defendant Brewer’s request that  
26 Arizona be permitted to condition acceptance of the Federal Form upon submission of  
27 supplemental evidence of citizenship, defendant Brewer subsequently advised the  
28

1 EAC Chairman, Paul S. DeGregorio, by letter dated March 13, 2006, that she “will  
2 instruct Arizona’s county recorders to continue to administer and enforce the  
3 requirement that all voters provide evidence of citizenship when registering to vote as  
4 specified in A.R.S. § 16-166(F).” On March 13, 2006, State Election Director Joseph  
5 Kanefield stated via email to all County Recorders that “Secretary Brewer’s position  
6 [is] that the proof of citizenship requirement set forth in A.R.S. § 16-166(F) must  
7 continue to be enforced for all newly registered voters and voters moving from one  
8 county to another. Secretary Brewer made this decision after consulting with the  
9 Arizona Attorney General.”

12 58. By letter dated March 22, 2006, counsel for plaintiffs LULAC, PFAWF  
13 and Rep. Gallardo notified defendant Brewer pursuant to 42 U.S.C. §1973gg- 9(b) of  
14 plaintiffs’ intent to bring a civil action on behalf of aggrieved persons under the  
15 National Voter Registration Act, based upon defendant Brewer’s refusal to accept,  
16 and her instructions to Arizona’s county recorders not to accept, the Federal  
17 Registration Form.

19 59. A civil action may be brought in an appropriate district court for  
20 declaratory or injunctive relief with respect to a violation of the NVRA if a state’s  
21 chief election officer fails to correct the violation within 90 days after receiving notice  
22 of such violation. If the violation occurs within 120 days after the date of an election  
23 for federal office, an action may be brought within 20 days after the chief election  
24 officer’s receipt of notice of the violation. 42 U.S.C. §1973gg- 9(b).



1                    **Unconstitutional Poll Tax on the Right to Vote In Violation of Both the**  
2                    **Fourteenth and the Twenty-Fourth Amendments**

3                    64.     The allegations of paragraphs 1 through 63 above are hereby  
4 incorporated as though fully set forth herein.

5                    65.     Section 1 of Twenty-fourth Amendment provides that:

6                    The right of citizens of the United States to vote in any primary or  
7 general election for President or Vice President, for electors for  
8 President or Vice President, or for Senator or Representative in  
9 Congress, shall not be denied or abridged by the United States or any  
10 State by reason of failure to pay a poll tax or other tax.

11                    By virtue of its prohibition of *abridgment* as well as denial of the  
12 right to vote, “the Twenty-fourth nullifies sophisticated as well as simple-  
13 minded modes of impairing the right to vote.” *Harman v. Fossenius*, 380 U.S.  
14 528, 540-41 (1965).

15                    66.     The repugnant results of the poll tax that prompted passage of the  
16 Twenty-fourth amendment are imminent in Arizona as a result of the Arizona  
17 Taxpayer and Citizen Protection Act: “disenfranchisement of the poor occasioned by  
18 failure to pay the tax,” as well as disenfranchisement of “a substantial number of  
19 voters who did not plan [ ]far [enough] ahead.” *Id.* at 539-40.

20                    67.     Conditioning the right to vote on the production of certain forms of  
21 identification impairs the ability of Arizona’s poor -- who are disproportionately  
22 minority and who historically have been disenfranchised -- to exercise that right. The  
23 requirements amount to a poll tax on Arizona citizens that do not have these forms of  
24 identification. Qualified Arizona citizens who are poor are the most likely to need to  
25 obtain these documents for the first time as a result of amended A.R.S. §16-166, and  
26  
27  
28

1 are also the least likely to have internet access (the fastest way to find out about how  
2 to obtain these documents and often to request them is online), least likely to be able  
3 to take time away from work and family to visit offices of public agencies in person  
4 during business hours, and least likely to be able to afford these documents.  
5

6 **Count Three**

7 **Violation of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, 42 U.S.C. §§ 1971(a)(2)(A)**

8  
9 68. The allegations of paragraphs 1 through 67 above are hereby  
10 incorporated as though fully set forth herein.

11 69. The polling place identification requirements of the Arizona Taxpayer  
12 and Citizen Protection Act, as set forth in A.R.S. §16-579 and the implementing  
13 regulations, violate the Civil Rights Act of 1964, 42 U.S.C. §1971(a)(2)(A), which  
14 provides that:  
15

16 No person acting under color of law shall-

17 (A) in determining whether any individual is qualified under State law  
18 or laws to vote in any election, apply any standard, practice, or  
19 procedure different from the standards, practices, or procedures  
20 applied under such law or laws to other individuals within the same  
21 county, parish, or similar political subdivision who have been found  
by State officials to be qualified to vote...

22 70. The polling place identification requirements violate 42 U.S.C. §  
23 1971(a)(2)(A) because different standards with respect to identification requirements  
24 are applied to individuals within the same county who vote in person at the polling  
25 place as compared to those who vote by early ballot. Electors who vote by early  
26 voting are not required to satisfy the identification requirements imposed by the Act.  
27

28 **Count Four**



1 Count Five

2 Section 2 of the Voting Rights Act

3  
4 75. The allegations of paragraphs 1 through 74 above are hereby  
5 incorporated as though fully set forth herein.

6 76. Section 2 of the Voting Rights Act of 1965 (42 U.S.C. § 1973(a))  
7 provides:

8  
9 No voting qualification or prerequisite to voting or standard, practice, or  
10 procedure shall be imposed or applied by any State or political  
11 subdivision in a manner which results in a denial or abridgment of the  
12 right of any citizen of the United States to vote on account of race or  
13 color.

14 77. Latino and Native American citizens of Arizona, as a group, have lower  
15 family and personal incomes than citizens of Arizona who are white and are less  
16 likely, as a group, to have Arizona driver’s licenses or passports deemed to be  
17 “satisfactory evidence” of U.S. citizenship than are white citizens.

18 78. Latino and Native American citizens of Arizona, as a group, have lower  
19 family and personal incomes than citizens of Arizona who are white and are less  
20 likely, as a group, to have Arizona driver’s licenses, bank or credit union statements,  
21 utility bills in their name, vehicle registration and insurance cards, or other  
22 government-issued identification deemed “acceptable” to establish identity at the  
23 polling place.

24 79. Native Americans on reservations are more likely to live in remote,  
25 rural locations at a greater distance to the polls, have unconventional addresses or no  
26 formal street address at all.  
27  
28



**Irreparable Harm/ Inadequate Remedy at Law**

1  
2           84.    Congressional and statewide elections that will be subject to the new  
3  
4 proof of citizenship and polling place identification requirements are scheduled for  
5 September 12, 2006 (primary) and November 7, 2006 (general).

6           85.    The plaintiffs and the members of the organizational plaintiffs who do  
7  
8 not have one of the forms of identification required by A.R.S. § 16-166 to establish  
9 proof of citizenship or required at the polls by the procedure for implementing A.R.S.  
10 § 16-579 will be irreparably harmed if they are forced, between now and the next  
11 election to either (a) obtain new identification, or (b) forfeit their rights as Arizona  
12 citizens qualified to register and vote in the next and subsequent elections or referenda  
13 in their respective voting districts or political subdivisions for which they cannot be  
14 adequately compensated in an action at law for money damages.

15           WHEREFORE, Plaintiffs respectfully pray that:

16           (a) the Court enter a declaratory judgment pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 2201 declaring  
17  
18 A.R.S. §§ 16-152, 16-166, 16-579 as amended by the Arizona Taxpayer and  
19  
20 Citizen Protection Act, unconstitutional, unlawful, null and void;

21           (b) the Court order that defendant and her agents, servants and employees are  
22  
23 immediately restrained from refusing to register voters who timely submit a  
24  
25 properly completed Federal Mail Voter Registration Form (the “Federal  
26  
27 Form”), but do not submit “satisfactory evidence of citizenship” as defined by  
28  
A.R.S. § 16-166(F).

1 (c) the Court enter a preliminary and permanent injunction pursuant to 42 U.S.C. §  
2 1973gg-9(a)(2) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 65 restraining and enjoining defendant  
3 from refusing to accept the Federal Mail Voter Registration Form without  
4 "satisfactory evidence of citizenship" as defined in A.R.S. § 16-166;  
5

6 (d) the Court enter a preliminary and permanent injunction pursuant to Fed. R.  
7 Civ. P. 65 restraining and enjoining defendant from enforcing or applying  
8 A.R.S. §§ 16-152, 16-166, 16-579 to deny plaintiffs or any other qualified  
9 Arizona resident the right to register voters, register to vote, obtain a ballot,  
10 cast a ballot, and have their ballots counted in any primary, general, special,  
11 run off or referenda election in Arizona because of their inability to provide  
12 documentary proof of citizenship as required by A.R.S. §§ 16-152 and 16-166,  
13 or to comply with the polling place identification requirements as set forth in  
14 the guidelines for implementing A.R.S. § 16-579;  
15

16 (e) Plaintiffs recover their reasonable attorney's fees and costs; and  
17

18 (f) Plaintiffs have such other and further relief as may be just and equitable.  
19

20 Respectfully submitted this 24th day of May, 2006  
21

22 OSBORN MALEDON, P.A.

23 By s/ David B. Rosenbaum  
24 Thomas L. Hudson  
25 David B. Rosenbaum  
26 Sara S. Greene  
27 2929 North Central  
28 21st Floor  
Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2793  
Cooperating Attorneys for American Civil  
Liberties Union Foundation

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

STEPTOE & JOHNSON LLP  
David J. Bodney  
Karen J. Hartman-Tellez  
Collier Center  
201 East Washington Street, Suite 1600  
Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2382  
Telephone: 602-257-5212  
Fax: 602-257-5299  
E-mail: dbodney@steptoe.com

LAWYERS' COMMITTEE FOR CIVIL  
RIGHTS UNDER LAW  
Jon Greenbaum  
Benjamin Blustein  
Monica Saxena  
1401 New York Avenue, Suite 400  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Telephone: 202-662-8315  
Fax: (202) 628-2858 (fax)  
E-mail: jgreenbaum@lawyerscommittee.org  
*PRO HAC VICE APPLICATION TO BE FILED*

ACLU Southern Regional Office  
Neil Bradley  
2600 Marquis One Tower  
245 Peachtree Center Avenue  
Atlanta, GA 30303  
Telephone: 404-523-2721  
Fax: 404-653-0331  
E-mail: nbradley@aclu.org  
*PRO HAC VICE APPLICATION TO BE FILED*

PEOPLE FOR THE AMERICAN WAY  
FOUNDATION  
Elliot M. Minberg  
2000 M Street, NW, Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20036  
Telephone: 202-467-4999  
Fax: 202-293-2672  
E-mail: eminberg@pfaw.org  
*PRO HAC VICE APPLICATION TO BE FILED*

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

THE LEAGUE OF UNITED LATIN  
AMERICAN CITIZENS  
Luis Roberto Vera, Jr.  
TX State Bar No. 20546740  
111 Soledad, Suite 1325  
San Antonio, TX 78205-2260  
Telephone: 210-225-3300  
Fax: 210-225-2060  
E-mail: lrvlaw@sbcglobal.net  
*PRO HAC VICE APPLICATION TO BE FILED*

AARP FOUNDATION LITIGATION  
Daniel B. Kohrman (DC Bar No. 394064)  
601 E Street, N.W., Suite A4-240  
Washington DC 20049  
Telephone: 202-434-2064  
Fax: 202-434-6424  
E-mail: dkohrman@aarp.org  
*PRO HAC VICE APPLICATION TO BE FILED*

THE INTER TRIBAL COUNCIL OF  
ARIZONA, INC.  
Joe P. Sparks, No. 002383  
Susan B. Montgomery, No. 020595  
Sparks, Tehan & Ryley PC  
7503 First St, Scottsdale AZ 85251  
Telephone: 480-949-1339  
Fax: 480-949-7587

**ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFFS**